

TravelWatch NORTHWEST



Report of a Survey by TravelWatch NorthWest of 100 specimen services operated by Northern Rail in the North West of England

April – October 2012

Contents

SECTION		PAGE
1	Introduction	2
2	TravelWatch NorthWest	3
3	The Survey - Design and methodology	3
4	Data analysis and results reporting	3
5	Interpreting the data tables	4
6	The data tables	5 – 16
7	Analysis of the results	17
7.1	Introduction	17
7.2	Facilities at joining stations	17
7.3	Departure time	17
7.4	The train environment	17
7.5	Revenue protection	18
7.6	Overcrowding	18
7.7	On-train announcements	18
8	Narrative comments	20
9	Day return to Liverpool	22
10	Conclusion and observations	23
11	Looking to the future	24
12	The questionnaire	25
13	The survey team	26

Cover photo: The signalman has a word with the driver as the 15.17 *Northern* service from Ormskirk to Preston calls at Rufford on 8th October 2012.

David Butterworth

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Northern Rail, referred to in all its publicity as *Northern*, provides nearly 2500 local and regional services each weekday across the north of England. With 4900 employees it is the largest train operator in the UK. Around 315 diesel and electric trains serve over 500 stations, of which 462 are managed by *Northern*. The *Northern* operation is a joint venture between Serco plc and Abellio (whose parent company is Netherlands Railways).
- 1.2 For the vast majority of local service rail users in the north of England *Northern* is the sole provider. On Merseyside most rail services are provided by MerseyRail (also a Serco/Abellio joint venture) but even there some routes are covered by *Northern* services. Inter-city and inter-urban services in the north of England are provided by Virgin Trains, East Coast Trains, First Transpennine Express and, to a lesser extent, Hull Trains, CrossCountry Trains, East Midlands Trains, Grand Central Trains and Scotrail.
- 1.3 In common with rail passengers everywhere, the expectation of *Northern's* passengers are that the company will provide train services which are safe, comfortable, affordable and punctual. The passengers likewise expect that the stations served will provide a level of customer provision appropriate to their location and usage.
- 1.4 Over the years of the *Northern* franchise anecdotal evidence has shown that there are widely varying opinions regarding passengers' satisfaction with the local services provided. People who come across a clean train which runs to time and is not overcrowded are naturally very satisfied. When everything goes according to plan this is the pleasing norm. There are times, regrettably quite regularly, when the passenger experience is unsatisfactory for a wide number of reasons. As noted above, most passengers have no choice in their rail service provider and have to bear the possible uncertainty of their journey. The most vociferous complainants are from those who use peak-hour trains which, it is generally sad to say, do not always provide an acceptable level of comfort or reliability.
- 1.5 Northern has become a victim of its own success, in that the franchise was envisaged as a no-growth operation throughout its original seven year life. The reality has been that overall passenger numbers have grown by 40% since the Northern operation commenced in December 2004. In the North West no new trains have been provided to carry the increased number of passengers; the region has instead seen only cascaded stock from elsewhere to supplement the existing fleet. There has been much positive action by Northern to reach a high service standard but the company is clearly thwarted by a generally poor standard of passenger accommodation in stark contrast to that provided in other parts of Great Britain.
- 1.6 In April 2012 the directors of TravelWatch NorthWest decided to conduct a survey of 100 journeys on Northern trains across the North West of England during the period from April to October 2012. The primary purpose was to assess the provision of specific facilities at joining stations and to assess selected aspects of the journey experience. Full details of the survey content, methodology, results and conclusions are provided in this report.

2. TravelWatch NorthWest

2.1 The Mission Statement of TWNW is '*Facilitating an integrated and seamless quality public transport network for North West England*'. Its vision is to champion the interests of public transport users in the North West so that the network (not just rail) can become:

- accessible to everyone;
- affordable and socially inclusive;
- available where and when it is needed;
- acceptable to all;
- attractive to users.

Its key objectives are:

- To give users a platform to express their concerns and needs;
- To promote integrated and sustainable public transport strategies;
- To produce influential best practice reports based on evidence.

2.2 The survey outlined in this report and the critical analysis of its findings falls within the remit of TWNW.

3. The Survey – Design and methodology

3.1 The survey team agreed that over the period between late April and the end of October 2012 board members of TWNW would complete questionnaires whilst carrying out their normal journeys on Northern trains. Every effort would be made to cover the whole of the North West region but, given limitations on the spread of board membership, this could not be guaranteed.

The survey questionnaire was designed to include the assessment of:

- the provision of ticket sales at stations at the commencement of journeys;
- the provision of train running information (CIS and/or PA systems);
- the provision of general train related information;
- the timely departure of the train;
- the standard of interior presentation of the train, including windows;
- the extent of the conductor's revenue protection and customer care duties;
- the extent of overcrowding of the train;
- the punctuality of the train at the assessor's destination;
- conductor announcements regarding calling point, connections and safety;
- conductor apologies in cases of late running or other adverse events.

3.2 Assessors were invited to provide additional narrative comments to amplify or explain an event when a 'Yes' or 'No' answer would not have been adequate.

3.3 In the style of the 'mystery shopper' the survey was carried out anonymously.

3.4 A copy of the questionnaire can be seen on Page 25

4. Data analysis and results reporting

4.1 The responses from each questionnaire were transcribed onto a spreadsheet which was then used to analyse the various assessable topics.

4.2 In common with previous surveys of this nature the complete set of data is reproduced on Pages 5 to 16. The results table has been subdivided into sets, each set representing a Service Group as used by Northern. The Service Groups which relate to this survey are:

- Lancashire & Cumbria (39 journeys)
- Merseyside and West Manchester (3 journeys)
- North Manchester (49 journeys)
- South Manchester (8 journeys)
- Tyne, Tees and Wear (1 journey) Total = 100 journeys

4.3 Comment is made regarding each of the assessed items, with statistical analysis if appropriate.

4.4 Narrative comments made by assessors are listed, to inform a more thorough understanding of particular events.

- 4.5 Finally a more in-depth analysis is provided for a series of six individual journeys which formed a day return journey from Clitheroe to Liverpool.

5. Interpreting the Data Tables (Pages 5 – 16)

- 5.1 **At the station** – The assessor looked at important aspects of customer service facilities at each station which formed the start of each individual journey. These included ticket sales, either from a staffed ticket office or from a working machine, the availability of train running information, by CIS screens and/or by spoken announcements, and the presence of general up-to-date information posters.
- 5.2 It was not always possible to assess the above features if an onward connecting train was due within a few minutes.
- 5.3 Within this section negative responses are highlighted in bold and features which could not be assessed, e.g. a station announcement may have been made but it could not be heard from within the train, are shown by a grey block. Stations managed by *Northern* are highlighted in green.
- 5.4 **On the Train** – This section includes most aspects which a passenger will expect to be provided on each journey, ranging from on-time departure, cleanliness of the train interior, its windows and the seating accommodation, the condition of toilet facilities and the overall on-train environment.
- 5.5 A train which left the joining station (not necessarily the originating station) up to 5 minutes late is shown in green, from five to ten minutes in orange and excessive lateness beyond ten minutes in red.
- 5.6 Those facilities which were judged to be below standard are shown in bold print with a brown highlight.
- 5.7 Facilities which could not readily be assessed, particularly toilets if the train was well loaded, are indicated by a grey block.
- 5.8 The extent of ticket checking and fare collection, generally known as Revenue Protection (RP), was assessed. The opportunity and justification for the conductor to carry out RP duties varies from journey to journey but, at the data collection stage, the actual RP level regardless of circumstances was recorded.
- 5.9 The trains which were judged to be overcrowded are shown in the results tables.
- 5.10 The extent of late (or sometimes early) arrival at the end point of the journey (not necessarily the end of the whole journey) is shown, again with traffic light shading to indicate the extent of lateness.
- 5.11 **The on-train public address system** – The extent to which the conductor chose to or was able to make announcements during the journey is shown, with a lack of specified announcements being shown by a bold 'N'.
- 5.12 **Assessors' Comments** – Members of the survey team were invited to add comments to explain or amplify aspects of a journey, particularly where this is necessary to understand negative responses. Whenever such a comment has been made the results table shows this by the Survey Sheet Number being highlighted within a brown block.

6. DATA TABLES

Lancs & Cumbria Group

Table 1A

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	01	02	04	05	09	14	18	19	21	22
Route code	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C
Timetabled start time	11.10	10.11	17.37	10.58	13.44	15.34	18.00	17.26	09.04	13.57
Journey from	BBN	YRK	LAN	BAR	BPS	LAN	BAR	BYM	PRE	LIV
Journey to	YRK	BBN	BAR	LAN	PRE	ARN	LAN	LDS	LIV	PRE
Date	08.05	11.05	22.05	22.05	23.05	15.05	16.10	15.05	18.06	18.06
Unit type	158	158	156	153	142	153	150	158	156	156
No of carriages	3	2	2	1	2	2	2	3	2	2
Reporter	DB	DB	JO	JO	JM	JO	RR	LG	JO	JO
JOINING STATION										
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	Y	N	N/A	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine working		Y	Y	N/A	N/A	Y	N		Y	Y
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	Y	N	N/A	Y	Y
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	Y	N	Y	Y	N
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
ON THETRAIN										
Actual departure time	11.10	10.11	17.38	10.59	13.15	15.35	18.00	07.29	09.06	13.57
Minutes late	0	0	1	1	1	1	0	3	2	0
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	N	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage	18	7	0	1	4	3	1	3	2	1
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Train overcrowded	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N
If YES - between which stations								BDI	SNH	
								LDS	LIV	
Greatest no of standees in carriage								20	12	
Actual arrival time	13.14	12.16	17.44	11.06	14.20	15.56	18.05	18.42	10.05	15.01
Timetabled arrival time	13.19	12.14	17.43	11.05	14.20	15.55	18.07	18.39	10.02	14.51
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	-5	2	1	1	0	1	-2	3	3	10
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM										
Apology or explanation if late	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N	N
Announcement re calling points			N	N	Y	N	N	Y	N	N
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N
Announcements re safety	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

Lancs & Cumbria Group

Table 1B

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)		23	24	30	31	32	34	36	37	38	39
Route code		L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C
Timetabled start time		16.29	07.38	06.38	09.55	15.37	15.17	08.15	09.04	13.57	15.22
Journey from		BPN	HBD	HBD	PRE	BPN	OMS	BBN	PRE	LIV	PRE
Journey to		HBD	BPN	BPN	BPN	PRE	PRE	PRE	LIV	PRE	BBN
Date		14.06	14.06	14.06	14.06	14.06	12.07	12.07	12.07	12.07	12.07
Unit type		158	158	158	150	150	150	158	156	156	150
No of carriages		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter		TY	TY	JM	RR	RR	JO	DB	DB	DB	DB
JOINING STATION											
Station staffed		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine available		Y	Y	?	?	?	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine working		Y	Y	?	?	?	Y	?	Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) available		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) working		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system available		?	Y	Y	Y	?	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system working		N	Y	Y	Y	N	N/A	N	N	Y	Y
Information posters in date		Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible		Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
ON THETRAIN											
Actual departure time		16.29	07.39	06.38	09.57	15.37	15.17	08.15	09.04	13.57	15.26
Minutes late		0	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	4
Destination panel(s) correct		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked			Y	Y			Y				
Heating and/or aircon acceptable		Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage		6	4	7	1	0	3	1	0	0	3
Announcements made if no ticket inspection		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N	N	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful		Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	Y
Train overcrowded		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
If YES - between which stations											
Greatest no of standees in carriage											
Actual arrival time		17.49	09.03	08.01	10.23	16.01	15.49	08.38	10.02	14.54	15.51
Timetabled arrival time		17.49	09.05	08.05	10.21	16.02	15.47	08.38	10.02	14.51	15.47
Minutes early (-) or late (+)		0	-2	-4	2	-1	2	0	0	3	4
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM											
Apology or explanation if late		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points		Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Announcements re approach to next station		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y
Announcements re safety		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

Lancs & Cumbria Group

Table 1C

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	41	42	43	54	57	58	59	61	64	65
Route code	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C
Timetabled start time	16.51	09.39	13.32	09.10	21.43	08.42	15.34	09.39	18.52	10.29
Journey from	LDS	LAN	LAN	BBN	BIF	ARN	LAN	LAN	SAS	FOX
Journey to	BYM	CNF	KBK	HBD	ARN	LAN	ARN	CNF	PRE	CAR
Date	15.05		16.06	24.07	23.07	24.07	24.07	23.08	28.08	17.09
Unit type	158	150	150	158	156	153+153	153+153	150	142	156
No of carriages	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter	LG	RR	RR	DB	JO	JO	JO	RR	RR	DB
JOINING STATION										
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N/A	Y	Y	N	N/A
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N
Ticket machine working		Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	?	N	N/A
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N/A
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
PA system working	Y	?	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	Y	N/A
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	?	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	?	Y	Y
ON THE TRAIN										
Actual departure time	17.00	09.43	13.32	09.10	21.43	08.43	15.34	09.39	18.58	10.29
Minutes late	9	4	0	0	0	1	0	0	6	0
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y			Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage	0	1	1	3	0	2	0	1	0	4
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N	N/A	N	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y
Train overcrowded	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
If YES - between which stations	LDS									
	BDI									
Greatest no of standees in carriage	20									
ARRIVAL										
Actual arrival time	17.58	09.53	14.02	09.55	22.23	09.07	15.55	09.49	19.25	12.45
Timetabled arrival time	17.57	09.49	14.02	09.49	22.23	09.07	15.55	09.49	19.20	12.39
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	-1	4	0	6	0	0	0	0	5	6
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYSTEM										
Apology or explanation if late	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N
Announcement re calling points	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Y		N	N
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Announcements re safety	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

Lancs & Cumbria Group

Table 1D

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	66	70	71	84	94	96	97	98	99
Route code	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C	L&C
Timetabled start time	17.27	09.10	09.39	09.37	09.04	08.06	09.04	15.57	17.22
Journey from	CAR	BBN	LAN	HDB	PRE	BBN	PRE	LIV	PRE
Journey to	FOX	HBD	CNF	PRE	LSP	PRE	LIV	PRE	BBN
Date	07.09	09.10	27.09	06.09	18.10	31.10	31.10	31.10	31.10
Unit type	153+153	158	150	150	150	158	150	150	142
No of carriages	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter	DB	DB	RR	JM	RR	DB	DB	DB	DB
JOINING STATION									
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine working	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	?
ON THETRAIN									
Actual departure time	17.38	09.13	09.42	10.05	09.05	08.18	09.10	15.57	17.32
Minutes late	11	3	3	28	1	2	6	0	10
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked				N					
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N
No of times conductor passed through carriage	3	3	1	4	5	1	0	0	0
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N	N
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	N/A
Train overcrowded	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	N	Y	N
If YES - between which stations	CAR					BBN		LIV	
	ASP					PRE		WGN	
Greatest no of standees in carriage	6					8		30	
Arrival Times									
Actual arrival time	19.40	09.50	09.52	12.28	11.29	08.42	10.30	16.54	18.00
Timetabled arrival time	19.30	09.50	09.49	10.32	11.27	08.38	10.02	16.54	17.48
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	10	0	3	116	2	4	28	0	12
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM									
Apology or explanation if late	N	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N
Announcement re calling points	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N
Announcements re safety	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)		91	92	93
Route code		MWM	MWM	MWM
Timetabled start time		11.44	12.05	09.39
Journey from		MCO	BWD	MCV
Journey to		BWD	DGT	LIV
Date		22.10	25.10	25.10
Unit type		142	156	150
No of carriages		2	2	4
Reporter		JO	JO	JM
JOINING STATION				
Station staffed		Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open		Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine available		Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine working		Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) available		Y	Y	Y
CIS screen(s) working		Y	Y	Y
PA system available		Y	Y	Y
PA system working		Y	Y	Y
Information posters in date		Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible		Y	Y	Y
ON THE TRAIN				
Actual departure time		11.44	12.08	09.39
Minutes late		0	3	0
Destination panel(s) correct		Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy		Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through		Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy		Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked		Y	Y	Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable		Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection		Y	Y	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage		1	2	3
Announcements made if no ticket inspection		N/A	N/A	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful		Y	Y	Y
Train overcrowded		N	N	N
If YES - between which stations				
Greatest no of standees in carriage				
ARRIVAL				
Actual arrival time		12.03	12.31	10.43
Timetabled arrival time		12.03	12.31	10.43
Minutes early (-) or late (+)		0	0	0
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYSTEM				
Apology or explanation if late		N/A	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points		N	N	Y
Announcements re approach to next station		Y	Y	N
Announcements re safety		N	N	Y

North Manchester Group

Table 3A

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	03	06	07	08	10	11	12	13	15	16
Route code	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM
Timetabled start time	16.07	15.40	10.40	09.46	16.48	17.17	09.04	09.04	16.48	08.26
Journey from	MCV	MCV	CLH	MCV	MCV	MCV	TOD	TOD	MCV	CLH
Journey to	BON	CLH	MCV	SLD	TOD	TOD	MCV	MCV	TOD	BBN
Date	22.05	22.05	22.05	23.05	24.04	25.04	25.04	26.04	10.05	11.10
Unit type	150	150	150+153	142	155	155+153	158	158+153	158	150
No of carriages	2	2	3	2	2	3	3	3	2	2
Reporter	JO	DB	DB	JM	JM	JM	JM	JM	JM	DB
JOINING STATION										
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
Ticket machine working	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
ON THETRAIN										
Actual departure time	16.07	15.40	10.40	09.46	16.48	17.19	09.28	09.13	16.48	08.26
Minutes late	0	0	0	0	0	2	24	9	0	0
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y		N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	W	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage	0	0	4	0	1	1	1	2	1	3
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N	N	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	N/A	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Train overcrowded	N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
If YES - between which stations		BON BMC								
Greatest no of standees in carriage	12	10								
Arrival Times										
Actual arrival time	16.27	16.56	11.50	09.52	17.12	18.00	09.57	09.38	17.13	08.48
Timetabled arrival time	16.25	16.56	11.50	09.52	17.14	17.54	09.30	09.30	17.13	08.47
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	2	0	0	0	-2	6	27	8	0	1
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM										
Apology or explanation if late	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	Y	N	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Announcements re safety	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y

North Manchester Group

Table 3B

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	17	20	25	26	27	28	29	33	35	40
Route code	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM
Timetabled start time	09.52	12.52	06.56	16.30	17.56	17.00	16.48	09.52	07.40	15.52
Journey from	BBN	TOD	RCD	RCD	HBD	MCV	MCV	WGW	CLH	BBN
Journey to	CLH	MCV	HBD	MCV	RCD	HBD	TOD	KIR	BBN	CLH
Date	11.10	08.07	14.06	12.06	14.06	29.06	13.06	12.07	12.07	12.07
Unit type	150	150	150+150	142	158	144+144	155	150	156+153	156+153
No of carriages	2	2	4	2	3	4	2	2	3	3
Reporter	DB	JM	TY	TY	TY	JM	JM	JO	DB	DB
JOINING STATION										
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N
Ticket machine working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	N/A
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	Y	N	N/A	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
ON THE TRAIN										
Actual departure time	09.52	12.52	06.56	16.30	17.57	17.00	17.10	09.56	07.40	15.52
Minutes late	0	0	0	0	1	0	22	0	0	0
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage	3	2	2	1	2	0	1	1	3	4
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	Y	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y
Train overcrowded	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
If YES - between which stations										
Greatest no of standees in carriage										
ARRIVAL TIMES										
Actual arrival time	10.16	13.23	07.13	16.53	18.14	17.40	17.42	10.21	08.02	16.13
Timetabled arrival time	10.17	13.24	07.14	16.52	18.14	17.41	17.20	10.19	08.01	16.17
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	1	-1	-1	1	0	-1	22	2	1	-4
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYSTEM										
Apology or explanation if late	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Y	N/A	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	Y	N
Announcements re approach to next station	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N
Announcements re safety	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	N

North Manchester Group

Table 3C

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	44	45	46	47	48	49	50	52	53	55
Route code	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM
Timetabled start time	16.24	09.40	10.52	08.22	09.32	10.27	13.04	15.03	08.26	09.56
Journey from	MAN	CLH	BBN	MAN	WGW	MCV	RCD	MAN	CLH	HBD
Journey to	TOD	BBN	CLH	WGW	MCV	GNF	SLD	BON	BBN	MCV
Date	17.07	23.07	23.07	14.07	14.07	14.07	14.07	14.07	24.07	24.07
Unit type	158	150	150	142	156	150	142	142	150	158
No of carriages	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter	JM	DB	DB	CD	CD	CD	CD	CD	DB	DB
JOINING STATION										
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
Ticket machine working	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A
CIS screen(s) available	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
CIS screen(s) working	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	N/A	Y	N	N
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
ON THETRAIN										
Actual departure time	16.40	09.40	11.07	08.22	09.22	10.35	13.04	15.03	08.33	09.56
Minutes late	16	0	15	0	0	8	0	0	7	0
Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
No of times conductor passed through carriage	0	4	2	1	2	4	3	0	2	2
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A
Conductor courteous and helpful	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y
Train overcrowded	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	N
If YES - between which stations								MCO		
								BON		
Greatest no of standees in carriage								30		
Actual arrival time	17.14	10.01	11.30	09.01	10.03	10.58	13.39	15.46	08.57	10.31
Timetabled arrival time	16.53	10.01	11.19	09.00	10.03	10.51	13.39	15.45	08.47	10.31
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	21	0	11	1	0	7	0	1	10	0
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM										
Apology or explanation if late	Y	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	Y	N/A	N	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Announcements re safety	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

North Manchester Group

Table 3D

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	56	60	63	67	68	69	72	73	74	75
Route code	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM
Timetabled start time	14.00	16.48	20.21	14.00	09.56	08.26	15.52	13.40	13.52	09.33
Journey from	MCV	MCV	MCV	MCV	HBD	CLH	BBN	CLH	MAN	BSV
Journey to	CLH	TOD	TOD	CLH	MCV	BBN	CLH	BBN	BSV	MAN
Date	24.07	02.08	30.08	09.10	09.10	09.10	01.10	01.10	20.09	10.09
Unit type	156	155	144	150	158	156	150+153	150+153	150	156
No of carriages	2	2	3	2	2	2	3	3	2	2
Reporter	DB	JM	JM	DB	DB	DB	DB	DB	DB	DB

JOINING STATION	Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
	Ticket machine working	Y	Y		Y	Y	N/A	Y	N/A	Y
	CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
	CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	N/A	Y
	PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	PA system working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
	Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

ON THETRAIN	Actual departure time	14.00	16.48	20.21	14.00	09.56	08.26	15.53	13.41	13.54	09.33
	Minutes late	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	2	0
	Destination panel(s) correct	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y	N	N			N				
	Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
	No of times conductor passed through carriage	1	1	0	3	3	2	3	0	2	3
	Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A
	Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y
	Train overcrowded	N	N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
	If YES - between which stations			MCV							
				MIH							
	Greatest no of standees in carriage			12							

	Actual arrival time	15.14	17.14	21.01	15.18	10.32	08.48	16.19	14.01	14.35	10.18
	Timetabled arrival time	15.19	17.14	20.58	15.18	10.32	08.48	16.17	14.01	14.35	10.18
	Minutes early (-) or late (+)	-5	0	3	0	0	0	-2	0	0	0

PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM	Apology or explanation if late	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	Announcement re calling points	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y
	Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y
	Announcements re safety	N	Y	N	N	N	Y	N	N	N	N

North Manchester Group

Table 3E

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	80	81	82	83	85	86	87	95	100
Route code	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM	NM
Timetabled start time	17.17	08.26	09.52	18.21	08.36	09.40	10.52	07.39	17.53
Journey from	MCV	CLH	BBN	MCV	TOD	CLH	BBN	CLH	BBN
Journey to	TOD	BBN	CLH	TOD	MCV	BBN	CLH	BBN	CLH
Date	11.10	12.10	12.10	17.09	13.09	17.09	17.09	31.10	31.10
Unit type	155	156	150+153	155	150	150	150	150	150
No of carriages	2	2	3	2	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter	JM	DB	DB	JM	JM	DB	DB	DB	DB

JOINING STATION	Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
Ticket machine working	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	N/A	Y
CIS screen(s) available	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
CIS screen(s) working	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	N/A	Y	N/A	Y
PA system available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
PA system working	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

ON THETRAIN	Actual departure time	17.18	08.29	09.52	18.21	08.37	09.50	10.57	07.41	18.05
Minutes late	1	3	0	0	1	10	5	2	12	
Destination panel(s) correct	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Interior clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y		Y	Y	Y			Y		
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	N	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	Y	N	
No of times conductor passed through carriage	0	4	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N	N/A	N/A	N	N	N	N	N/A	N	
Conductor courteous and helpful	N/A	Y	Y	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Y	N/A	
Train overcrowded	Y	N	N	N	Y	N	N	N	N	
If YES - between which stations	MCV				RCD					
	RCD				MCV					
Greatest no of standees in carriage	60				20					

	Actual arrival time	18.01	08.49	10.19	18.52	09.08	10.11	11.18	08.02	18.25
Timetabled arrival time	17.55	08.48	10.16	18.52	09.08	10.01	11.19	08.01	18.20	
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	6	1	-3	0	0	10	-1	1	5	

PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM	Apology or explanation if late	N	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A	Y
Announcement re calling points	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	
Announcements re approach to next station	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	Y	
Announcements re safety	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	N	

South Manchester Group

Table 4

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	51	76	77	78	79	88	89	90
Route code	SM	SM	SM	SM	SM	SM	SM	SM
Timetabled start time	14.14	10.48	11.39	12.17	13.04	09.52	10.44	11.21
Journey from	MAN	MAN	GLO	MAN	ALT	MAN	FNV	SPT
Journey to	MIA	GLO	MAN	ALT	MAM	FNV	SPT	MAN
Date	14.07	20.09	20.09	20.09	20.09	28.08	22.10	22.10
Unit type	323	323	323	156	142	150	150	156
No of carriages	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2
Reporter	CD	DB	DB	DB	DB	JO	JO	JO
JOINING STATION								
Station staffed	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Ticket office open	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	NA	Y
Ticket machine available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Ticket machine working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	NA	Y
CIS screen(s) available	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
CIS screen(s) working	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	NA	Y
PA system available	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
PA system working	Y	Y	NA	Y	Y	Y	NA	Y
Information posters in date	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Information posters legible	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
ON THETRAIN								
Actual departure time	14.14	10.48	11.39	12.17	13.06	09.52	10.44	11.21
Minutes late	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0
Destination panel(s) correct	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interior clean and tidy	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Windows clean and see through	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y				Y	Y	Y	Y
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
No of times conductor passed through carriage	1	0	2	2	1	3	5	0
Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A	N	Y	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Y
Conductor courteous and helpful	Y	N/A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Train overcrowded	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
If YES - between which stations								
Greatest no of standees in carriage								
Arrival Times								
Actual arrival time	14.39	11.19	12.12	12.46	13.36	10.31	11.12	11.32
Timetabled arrival time	14.38	11.19	12.12	12.46	13.37	10.28	11.12	11.32
Minutes early (-) or late (+)	1	0	0	0	-1	3	0	0
PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM								
Apology or explanation if late	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N	N/A	N/A
Announcement re calling points	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N
Announcements re approach to next station	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N
Announcements re safety	N	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	N

Survey sheet number (in bold if a comment is included)	62
Route code	TT&W
Timetabled start time	15.26
Journey from	CAR
Journey to	SUN
Date	28.08
Unit type	156
No of carriages	2
Reporter	JO

JOINING STATION	Station staffed	Y
	Ticket office open	Y
	Ticket machine available	Y
	Ticket machine working	Y
	CIS screen(s) available	Y
	CIS screen(s) working	Y
	PA system available	Y
	PA system working	Y
	Information posters in date	Y
	Information posters legible	Y

ON THETRAIN	Actual departure time	15.28
	Minutes late	2
	Destination panel(s) correct	Y
	Interior clean and tidy	Y
	Windows clean and see through	Y
	Seating/tables clean and tidy	Y
	Toilets clean, tidy & stocked	Y
	Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Y
	Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Y
	No of times conductor passed through carriage	4
	Announcements made if no ticket inspection	N/A
	Conductor courteous and helpful	Y
	Train overcrowded	N
	If YES - between which stations	
	Greatest no of standees in carriage	

	Actual arrival time	17.12
	Timetabled arrival time	17.14
	Minutes early (-) or late (+)	-2

PUBLIC ADDRESS SYTEM	Apology or explanation if late	N/A
	Announcement re calling points	N
	Announcements re approach to next station	Y
	Announcements re safety	N

7. Analysis of the Results

- 7.1 The sample size for this survey constitutes only a small fraction of the overall number of trains operated by Northern, even over the North West area, but the resultant data relates to an essentially random selection of journeys made over the summer months of 2012. The majority of surveyed journeys were made by assessors in the course of their normal train journeys.

7.2 Facilities at the joining station

- 7.2.1 **TICKET AVAILABILITY** – Tickets were available at all the stations which have either a staffed ticket office or a machine. The only instances of ticket offices closed during the normal opening times were at Todmorden at 09.04 (Journey 13) and at Wigan Wallgate during the period when renovation was taking place (Journeys 33 and 48). No ticket machines were found to be faulty by casual inspection. It was not normally possible to test the detailed operation of each machine prior to boarding the train.
- 7.2.2 **CIS SCREENS** – Whenever these were provided they were in operation. The display on the old ‘TV style’ displays, e.g. at Blackburn, were judged to be difficult to read, especially when the sun was shining.
- 7.2.3 **PUBLIC ADDRESS SYSTEMS** – There were **18 instances where no announcements were heard** even though a PA system was known to be installed. There could however have been instances where the sound of the train drowned out the messages.
- 7.2.4 **GENERAL INFORMATION POSTERS** – In the cases where they could readily be checked all the information posters were in-date and all but one were legible. The exception was at Kirkby on 12th July (Journey 33).

7.3 Departure time

- 7.3.1 **15% of trains started the assessed section of the journey over five minutes late.** In all but two of these cases the assessor provided a reason for the delay. **On a more positive note 57% of trains departed on time.**

7.4 The train environment

- 7.4.1 **DESTINATION PANELS WERE CORRECT – 96% of the trains carried correct destinations on the front and rear panels.** It was however noted that some were not correctly aligned and those on Pacer units were often hard to read.
- 7.4.2 **THE INTERIOR OF THE TRAIN WAS CLEAN AND TIDY – 89% of train interiors were judged to be sufficiently clean and tidy,** at a level which will satisfy the majority of passengers. It was pleasing to see that later in the survey period some trains carried on-train cleaners who were making a significant difference to the train environment during a journey. One cleaner was even observed wiping grab rails and handles with an antiseptic cloth.
- 7.4.3 **THE CONDITION OF THE WINDOWS** – After a long period during which train windows were becoming progressively dirtier and caked with a brown surface film, more recently there has been a significant pleasing improvement. **On only 2% of the trains were the windows judged to be less than clean.**
- 7.4.4 **CLEANLINESS OF SEATING AND TABLES** – **On 93 % of the trains the seats and tables (if present) were judged to be clean and acceptable.** It is regrettable that some passengers choose to put their feet on facing seats and are not challenged by some conductors. The MerseyRail approach, whereby such passengers face a penalty, would be appreciated on *Northern* trains.
- 7.4.5 **CONDITION OF TOILETS** – It was not always possible to assess the condition of the toilets if, for instance, the train was well loaded. **Of the 60 toilets inspected nine (15%) were judged to be either unclean, not fully stocked or inoperative.**

7.4.6 **LEVEL OF AMBIENT TEMPERATURE – Of the 97 trains assessed, 90 (93%) were judged to be at the right temperature.** It was noted however that, for instance, a two-coach train may have one warm carriage and one much cooler.

7.5 Revenue protection

7.5.1 It is a matter of concern among TravelWatch members and many other members of the travelling public that on a significant number of journeys tickets are not checked and/or fares are not collected. The results obtained in this survey confirm that there is a real problem in this regard.

7.5.2 There are a number of practical reasons why a conductor may not pass through the train to carry out his/her RP duties. Among these are the problem of a crowded train, the departure of the train from a station where the tickets will already have been checked, the absence of boarding passengers at stations en-route or, increasingly common, the lack of a fully functioning ticket machine.

7.5.3 **TICKET INSPECTION AND/OR FARE COLLECTION – This function was assessed on all the 100 trains in the survey. On 26 of those trains the conductor was not seen in the assessor's carriage.** The train was crowded in 7 of the instances where the conductor did not pass through, but the crowding may not have been a problem for the whole of the assessed journey.

7.5.4 There is no direct correlation between the number of calling stations and the number of times the conductor passed through the train, for the reasons outlined above, but it was noted that some conductors chose to ignore small numbers of joining passengers and then collect their fares at a later stage. This sometimes resulted in the conductor running out of time before the passengers left the train at the next major station.

7.5.5 There were only three occasions when an apology was given for non-collection of fares. These were instances when the ticket machine was either not provided or did not function correctly.

7.5.6 In all observed cases the conductor was judged to be pleasant and helpful.

7.6 Overcrowding

7.6.1 **In 11% of journeys the train was clearly overcrowded,** to the extent that passengers were standing in the vestibules and in the train aisles. In such cases, not always at peak times, the conductor could not pass through and passengers found leaving the train difficult.

7.6.2 On one occasion some 60 extra passengers crowded into one of carriages of a two-carriage train at Manchester Victoria (Journey 80). The conductor apologised for the lack of the usual third carriage.

7.7 On-train announcements

7.7.1 It is not always possible for the conductor to carry out door opening/closing, fare collection and make announcements within a very short time. Some conductors make valiant efforts to inform passengers of the next station and even to advise them of connections when approaching a major interchange but these tend to be haphazard due to the very nature of the conductor's job.

7.7.2 **APOLOGY FOR LATE ARRIVAL – There were five instances where the conductor apologised for the late arrival of the train** (usually only at its final destination) and 20 instances where this could have been expected but was not done.

7.7.3 **ANNOUNCEMENT OF CALLING POINTS AT START OF JOURNEY – It is important that passengers, particularly those who do not travel regularly on the route, are able to confirm that they are on the correct train. For the 97 journeys for which this was recorded 40 conductors announced the calling points for the rest of the train's journey but 57 conductors did not.**

- 7.7.4 **ANNOUNCEMENT OF APPROACH TO THE NEXT CALLING POINT** – Announcements as the train approached the next calling point were more frequent, with **64% of conductors making the announcement**. The remaining 36% did not announce the approach to the next station, either because they were busy on other duties or they chose not to.
- 7.7.5 **SAFETY ANNOUNCEMENTS** – **On only 17% of the journeys did the conductor make specific reference to the safety instructions**. When they are announced the instruction require passengers to acquaint themselves with the instructions which are posted at each end of the carriage. On a normally loaded train this can prove to be difficult, if not impossible, with the obedient passenger facing the likelihood of losing his/her seat.

8. Narrative comments relating to individual journeys

Table No.	Journey No.	Comment
1A	2	The train was not cleaned during the layover at York.
	4	The destination blinds showed Lancaster at each end. At Bare Lane station most of the trains arrive/depart from P2, but the poster explaining the system is only on P2. It may not be seen by passengers unfamiliar with the arrangement.
	14	Time taken for ticket inspection/sales and walk through prevented any available time to make announcements. However, the conductor was helpful to passengers.
	18	The conductor was only able to sell tickets to a few passengers who boarded at Bare Lane before reaching Lancaster. No time for announcements.
1C	41	There was no obvious reason for the 9 minute delayed start from Leeds and no apology was made. Only one partial ticket inspection was made (prior to Burnley Man Rd). The conductor had been seen chatting for some 15 minutes to a group of 'friends'.
	57	No litter/newspapers had been cleaned from the train at Barrow, despite the lengthy dwell time. Approaching station name announcements were 'grunted'.
	64	Many passengers joined at unstaffed stations but there was no fare collection nor were announcements made. The train was '97% full' but all were seated.
1D	66	The two previous trains from Carlisle round the Cumbrian Coast had been cancelled due to a lineside problem at Askam. No buses were provided in lieu nor was alternative routeing via Lancaster/Barrow for Millom, etc.
	84	This train left Hebden Bridge 28 minutes late and was further delayed at Bamber Bridge due to an incident. The conductor apologised for the late arrival at Preston (116 minutes) but not for the initial delay.
	96 97 98 99	See Section 9 for comments about these journeys.
2	93	The conductor only passed through the carriage 3 times although there were 13 stops. Only 2 announcements were made for approaching stations.
3A	3	The conductor did not pass through the train but his announcements were clear and 'friendly'. However it was difficult to hear them due to the noise of the train.
	6	When the conductor chooses not to pass through the train it is impossible for passengers to request a stop at Entwistle.
	7	No toilet roll evident. Announcements were made but not understandable due to noise of train (hot day – windows open).
	8	No water in toilet/sink.
	13	The train was shown as running on time on the Todmorden CIS but disappeared from the screen at 09.04. It arrived at 09.13.

3B	20	The single toilet was out of order.
	28	This train was formed of two connected Class 144 units. The conductor could not pass into the front pair.
	33	<p>a) Wigan Wallgate station was being refurbished and passengers were presented with a confusing reception area. There were no help points and the many staff were unforthcoming in offering help.</p> <p>b) The CIS stated the next train was the 09.52 to Kirkby. A train with its doors open stood in the platform. Half this train was the delayed 09.24 which left at 09.40 for Southport. The other half then left for a siding. Another train arrived, stood in the platform for a few minutes and then also left for a siding. The Kirkby train arrived a few minutes late. Throughout these manoeuvres the CIS remained the same and no staff made announcements, leaving passengers to fend for themselves. Passengers could have boarded any of the wrong trains.</p>
	35	A door fault prevented the conductor from checking tickets beyond the rear carriage. He apologised for his non-appearance and the intrusive beeping noise from the faulty door. He also experienced problems with his ticket machine after Ramsgreave & Wilpshire station and could not issue further tickets.
	40	The assessor was travelling from Preston to connect into the Clitheroe train at Blackburn. The latter was standing at Platform 1 as the late running ex Preston train arrived on Platform 2. A very quick dash across the station prevented the Clitheroe conductor from closing his doors, even though he could see that the other train had just arrived. Approx 6 people were thus able to join the train. The conductor explained that it is against the rules to hold the train 'for any reason'. He fully understood the plight of stranded passengers but claimed he would be disciplined for waiting (even for 1 minute and with the connecting train present). This is despite the fact that the Clitheroe train has a layover of at least 15 minutes before its return.
3C	44	Although the train was not crowded the conductor did not collect fares from passengers joining the train at Walsden (some of whom left at Todmorden).
	47	A passenger boarded at Oxford Road with a cycle at the centre door (Class 142) and stayed sitting on the cycle, leaning against the toilet door. Despite a lengthy stop at Salford Crescent the conductor walked past without requesting him to move to the cycle storage area at the end door.
	50	The conductor was unable to complete RP duties due to a combination of short journey times between stations and the number of passengers standing.
	52	Whilst the train stood at Manchester Airport prior to departure the only lighting was the dim emergency lighting. This created an unwelcoming environment. The full lights were switched on only 1 minute before departure.
	55	The train interior was generally clean but the table tops had ingrained dirt on them.
3D	56	The conductor passed through the train only once, after Salford Crescent, on the whole journey to Clitheroe. Calling point announcements were made but the conductor's diction was poor to the extent that most station names were unintelligible.
	60	The train was not cleared of litter at Manchester Victoria prior to its return. The toilet was judged to be untidy.
	63	The single toilet did not flush. There was a poor water flow to the basin. Calling point announcements were not fully made.

3D	67	It was pleasing to see an on-train cleaner after Bolton. In addition to picking up litter he wiped the handrails with an antiseptic cloth.
	69	The windows were heavily marked and hard to see through. The toilet was marked 'Out of Use'. Calling point announcements were made but they were hardly understandable.
	72	An on-train cleaner was present again (see 3D/67).
3E	83	The normally automatic toilet door had to be opened manually. No RP activity was observed so this allowed free travel between Walsden and Todmorden (see 3C/44).
	85	There was no RP activity before Rochdale, after which the train was crowded.
	86	There was no RP activity due to a broken ticket machine.
	87	Ditto
	95 100	See Section 9 for comments about these journeys.
4	76	The train was clean and tidy, almost 'new looking', but the announcements were inaudible.
	77	The conductor only passed through the train after passengers joined at unstaffed stations (2).
	78	The conductor carried out sufficient RP duties and was most pleasant and helpful to each passenger in turn, providing useful travel advice. A real credit to the team.
	79	Faulty toilet door lock, which required the use of a foot to ensure privacy!

9. Day Return to Liverpool

- 9.1 On 31st October it was necessary to go to Liverpool from Clitheroe and return the same day. The route via Blackburn and Preston ensured that *Northern* trains would be used. The six legs of the return journey presented various scenarios which gave either cause for congratulation or concern. There are many notable aspects regarding the *Northern* operation but this snapshot of a single day's travel has identified just a few of the worrying aspects, the worst of all being the apparent casual attitude towards revenue protection. Far too many people are 'enjoying' the pleasure of free rides across the North West and boasting about it to their friends, who then must believe it is the norm.
- 9.2 **07.39 Clitheroe to Blackburn** The Class 153 + 150 unit had arrived from Manchester on time and, as usual, waited for departure from Platform 1. The train left Clitheroe two minutes late as a result of the driver chatting to the conductor. The leading Class 153 unit had no connection with the rest of the train so it would not normally have been possible for the conductor to carry out RP duties in that section. However after Langho an Assistant Fare Collector appeared and carried out RP checks until Blackburn. He displayed good customer care skills. The train environment was generally acceptable but rather cool. Some announcements were made.
- 9.3 **08.16 Blackburn to Preston** The Class 158 (2 car) unit departed two minutes late and arrived in Preston four minutes late. It was well loaded, with passengers standing in the aisles and end vestibules. Despite this the conductor passed through the train twice, checking tickets etc. No announcements were made.
- 9.4 **09.04 Preston to Liverpool** The Class 150 unit was quite well loaded (but all seated) when it left Preston six minutes late. The conductor was not seen throughout the whole journey and only after Wigan were some announcements made. When this train arrived at Wigan the 09.38 Liverpool stopper was waiting on Platform 6. The late running ex Preston train left Wigan but was held to allow the stopper to gain access to the Liverpool line ahead of the limited stop train. A very slow journey resulted in arrival in Liverpool Lime Street 28 minutes late. No apology was made for the very late arrival. It is understood that the train was terminated at Lime Street and did not run on to Liverpool South Parkway. This situation was clearly the result of poor train regulation by Network Rail rather than any shortcoming by *Northern*.

- 9.5 **15.57 Liverpool to Preston** The main CIS screen in the concourse at Lime Street showed that this train would leave from Platform 4. Passengers passed the chatting barrier personnel and waited on Platform 4 only to be told some minutes later that the Preston train would now leave from Platform 2. A train arrived on Platform 2 and everyone assumed that this was the Preston train (and no-one contradicted them). Once everyone was comfortable (in the Class 156 unit) they were told to move to the train in front, which had arrived shortly after the Class 156. This Class 150 unit became very heavily loaded, with many standees until Wigan. Understandably the conductor was unable to carry out RP duties until then but he did not appear afterwards for the rest of the journey to Preston even though all passengers were seated. No announcements were made.
- 9.6 **17.22 Preston to Blackburn** This train (a Class 142 unit) left Preston 10 minutes late. Throughout the journey to Blackburn the conductor did not carry out RP duties nor were any announcements made. The train arrived in Blackburn 12 minutes late.
- 9.7 **17.53 Blackburn to Clitheroe** It had been expected that the connection into this Clitheroe train would have been missed but it too was running 12 minutes late so all was not lost! There was no explicit apology for the delay but it was announced as 'the late running 17.53 train'. Announcements for each of the calling points were made but otherwise there was no sign of the conductor. On arrival at Clitheroe (5 minutes late) the assessor asked the conductor why no fares had been collected from those who had joined the train at the three unstaffed stations after Blackburn. He variously replied 'the train was crowded' (it was until Blackburn but not afterwards), 'there were rowdy youths on the train' (there were youths but they were very well behaved), 'I don't collect fares at night' (but it was only 6 o'clock). He admitted to having a working ticket machine and when asked how he actually spent his time he declared that he had been reading his Rule Book. Whether he collected any fares on the return journey to Manchester is not known.

10. Conclusion and observations

- 10.1 This survey of just 100 journeys on *Northern* trains represents a mere fraction of all the trains which ran during the survey period, but it still gives a realistic snapshot of the good and the bad which the travelling public experience.
- 10.2 Across the *Northern* 'patch' there is a wide variety of train types and ages. In comparison with trains in other regions of Great Britain, apart from the relatively new Class 333 units operating in West Yorkshire, *Northern's* fleet of trains is time-worn – their present average age being nearly 24 years. Most trains in the North West are 2-car diesel units which have increasingly become unable to cope with peak hour crowds, although some additional trains have been brought in to help alleviate the very high growth in passenger numbers. Whilst efforts have clearly been made to keep the units in reasonable condition many of them are showing their age at a point where they will soon be beyond economic repair. In comparison with conditions in other parts of GB the Class 142 Pacer units used in the North West offer less than ideal comfort which still has to be endured by thousands every day. The electric units used on some south Manchester services are internally in very good condition, with the result that a ride in them is pure delight in comparison with the conditions endured by passengers north of the city.
- 10.3 Given the parlous state of train provision *Northern* has made a valiant effort to maintain standards under adversity. It is pleasing to see trains being cleared of litter at turnaround stations and, more recently, the appearance of on-train cleaners. Their work is appreciated.
- 10.4 The overall condition of train toilets is patchy (as shown in the survey results), although it must be said that the behaviour of some passengers does not help the drive for higher standards.
- 10.5 Again, in stark comparison to the situation elsewhere, few trains boast the luxury of air conditioning, with the result that the opening of train windows causes draughts elsewhere in the carriage and an increase in the overall noise level.
- 10.6 Train conductors appear to be faced with a multitude of conflicting duties all at the same time. Their primary responsibility is the safety of the train and its passengers but they are also tasked with opening and closing the train doors, selling tickets (when passengers have joined at unstaffed stations), checking existing tickets, giving travel advice to passengers (particularly those who are new or only occasional travellers) and fitting in the making of announcements (which requires a walk to the rear of the train). When there are many passengers and/or unstaffed stations in quick succession the conductor usually has an impossible task. Regrettably passengers who have not

been sold tickets are forced to join the queue at their staffed destination station. Thus a quick exit from the station is hindered through no fault of the passenger.

- 10.7 The installation of ticket machines at the more heavily used unstaffed stations, with the usual requirement for passengers to purchase their tickets before travel, would lighten the conductor's load and increase revenue. It is hoped however that this would not give certain conductors the incentive to hide away in their back cab.
- 10.8 This survey has confirmed that an absence of revenue protection duties, for whatever reason, has affected a quarter of journeys covered. It has already been noted that on an overcrowded train, normally but not exclusively at peak-time, the conductor is physically unable to pass through the train but the survey identified many instances where this was not the case. It is known that there is a shortage of functional ticket machines, particularly at certain times of the day in some areas, with the result that countless passengers are given the opportunity to ride free of charge. If this happens frequently it creates an attitude among some passengers that they don't really need to pay and among others who have already paid who are thus critical of a system which allows others to 'get away with it'.
- 10.9 The physical absence of a conductor within the body of the train also prevents passengers seeking travel advice, alerting the conductor of the need to leave at a 'request stop' and appreciating the security provided by having a visible member of staff on board. A lack of announcements, which often goes hand in hand with an 'absent' conductor, can create anxiety among occasional users as to where they will need to leave the train. In this regard there is a marked contrast between the on-train environment of a modern, smooth, quiet Class 333 unit from Skipton to Leeds, with a highly visible hardworking conductor and both spoken and visual announcements, and a noisy Class 150 from Manchester Victoria to Clitheroe, where the conductor is not seen, there are no announcements and the poor passenger who wants a pint at the Strawbury Duck (Entwistle) cannot request to leave the train. Sadly this happens all too frequently.

11. Looking to the future

- 11.1 As mentioned at the beginning of this report the Northern train fleet numbers 315 train units. It is estimated that 75% of these are reaching the end of their working lives having given sterling service since the elimination of the first series of diesel multiple units, (introduced after the steam age), in the 1980's. It has been claimed in some quarters that the 142 and 144 "Pacer" units do not comply with modern safety requirements and indeed, in 2019 many of the units will not be compliant with DDA requirements, rendering them unusable. Thus a sizeable train building programme will be required to replace the fleet in the not too distant future and as it currently takes over 3 years to replace a modestly sized train fleet from the initial agreement to entering service, some major decisions will be needed quite soon.
- 11.2 North West electrification will hopefully enable more capacity to be provided on both electrified and, by releasing diesel trains, on non-electrified routes. However, with no movement towards **new** and more comfortable and spacious trains in sight, the stakeholders face a challenging dilemma, if they are to continue to provide train services to meet the needs of the North West of England in the next decade.
- 11.3 Much is currently made of the High Speed Rail proposals and the aspiration for it to reach Manchester in the foreseeable future. It would be ironic if travellers disembarking from these sleek new trains are presented with 3rd world units to complete their journeys to their final destination.

12. The questionnaire

TravelWatch NORTHWEST Northern Survey 2012

Journey: ____:____ From: _____ To: _____

Date: _____ Unit type: _____ No. of carriages: ____ Reporter: _____

At station:

Comments

Is the station staffed?	Yes / No
Ticket office open	Yes / No / n.a
Ticket machine a) available and b) working	a) Yes / No b) Yes / No / n.a
CIS screens a) available and b) working	a) Yes / No b) Yes / No / n.a
PA system a) available and b) working	a) Yes / No b) Yes / No / n.a
Information posters a) in date and b) legible	a) Yes / No b) Yes / No

On train:

Actual departure time	____:____
Each destination panel correct	Yes / No
Train interior clean and tidy	Yes / No
Windows clean and see through	Yes / No
Seating/tables clean and tidy	Yes / No
Toilets clean, tidy and stocked	Yes / No
Heating and/or aircon acceptable	Yes / No
Ticket inspection and/or fare collection	Yes / No

No. of times conductor passed through carriage _____

Announcement made to explain lack of ticket inspection Yes / No / n.a

Conductor courteous and helpful Yes / No

Train overcrowded Yes / No

If yes – between which stations: _____

Greatest number of standing passengers in your carriage _____

Actual arrival time ____:____

PA system:

Apology/explanation if late Yes / No / n.a

Announcements re calling points
(including connections if any) Yes / No

Announcements re approaching next station Yes / No

Announcements re safety Yes / No

Further comments or observations may be made on the reverse of this form or below if emailed.

13. The survey team

Questionnaire design	Chris Dale
Data analysis and report	David Butterworth
Assessors	David Butterworth Chris Dale John Moorhouse John Owen Richard Rollins Tony Young

For further details about the work of TravelWatch NorthWest please contact:

John Moorhouse, Company Secretary
TravelWatch NorthWest
11 Harvelin Park
Todmorden
OL14 6HX

Telephone: 07807 768124
email: admin@travelwatch-northwest.org.uk